



ENTREPRENEURSHIP
EMPLOYABILITY EDUCATION

Independent Communications Authority of South Africa

350 Witch-Hazel Avenue

Eco Point Office Park

Eco Park

Centurion

Gauteng

31 January 2020

Attention: Mr Davis Kgosimolao Moshweunyane

Email: DMoshweunyane@icasa.org.za

**SUBMISSION BY COMMUNITY AND INDIVIDUAL DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION
FOR ENTREPRENEURSHIP, EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT (“E³”) ON THE
NOTICE ON THE LICENSING PROCESS FOR INTERNATIONAL MOBILE
TELECOMMUNICATIONS (“IMT”) SPECTRUM**

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 We refer to the Notice on the Licensing process for International Mobile Telecommunications (“IMT”) Spectrum published as Notice 597 of 2019 in Government Gazette no 42820 on 1 November 2019 (“**the IMT Spectrum Notice**”).
- 1.2 E³ thanks the Authority for providing us with the opportunity to submit our comments on the IMT Spectrum Notice.

222 Struben Street, Pretoria Central, Pretoria, 0001, South Africa.

2. ABOUT THE E³ INITIATIVE

- 2.1 E³ is an initiative of the Department of Basic Education ("DBE") that uses student-centred learning, including projects and games, in the existing CAPS curriculum to better prepare learners for the modern economy. The goal of E³ is to inspire 100% of learners to complete school and 100% of these learners to study further, get a job, or start their own enterprises. E³ is the response of the Department of Basic Education to the issue of high youth employment in South Africa.
- 2.2 **Background:** In 2012, CIDA was invited to chair a Task Team of the Human Resource Development Council, under the office of the Presidency of South Africa, named Enabling Entrepreneurship Technical Task Team ("EETTT"). This team performed 5-yrs of research, culminating in a recommendation to Government which was then later documented in a national policy for the education system. The task team was then invited to provide technical support to implement this policy.
- 2.3 In its pre-pilot year (2018), the project, now named E³, utilised project-based learning in trials in 3 provinces, across 73 schools and in grades 7, 8 & 9. Simultaneously, a team was hired, an M&E partner identified and a strategy designed and implemented. In 2019 the pilot grew to all 9 provinces in 7 grades and in 332 schools.
- 2.4 **Rationale:** The massive and rising youth unemployment - particularly on exit from high school - stands at around 67% of youth between the ages of 18 to 24. At 7.5m, SA has the third highest level of youth unemployment in the world. The need to foster greater levels of entrepreneurship for job creation is now at a critical stage. Some 13 million (70%) jobs are provided by the small business sector, and millions more in the informal sector. However, SA has the lowest Total Entrepreneurial Activity ("TEA") score in Africa. This is largely attributed to the absence of an entrepreneurial culture, poor educational outcomes and a lower tendency to retry after failed attempts.
- 2.5 E³ is a critical system change initiative in the South African national school education system, that will ultimately impact all learners in the SA school system (12.9 million learners), that is owned by the DBE, and supported by key non-profit organizations.

It is because of a number of key “levers” at E³'s disposal that it is able to achieve real success and scale. These levers centre around the fact that E³ is now national policy for the Department of Education and is a key priority of the President and the government.

- 2.5.1 E³ is one of the four top strategic priorities of the education ministry in its next 5-year plan.
 - 2.5.2 E³ is part of the national curriculum (CAPS) at all grade levels for all subjects (i.e. it is not an extra-mural add-on).
 - 2.5.3 E³ forms part of the national assessment (marks) system, so learners need to participate to pass.
 - 2.5.4 Teachers will earn continuing professional education credits as well as certification free of charge that will assist them with promotions and financial incentives.
 - 2.5.5 The E³ team has access to best-practice NGOs to assist, and the ability to offer them national access to all schools.
 - 2.5.6 Other access includes International experts who offer insights and help and who have actually implemented this type of approach over many years.
 - 2.5.7 Having core partners [NECT; NLF, Care for Ed/Lego Foundation] who have successfully implemented system-change initiatives in the SA school system means that it has live access to relevant real-time data for over 10.5 million learner and effective delivery role-models and will be integrated across all grades from R-12.
- 2.6 **Modus operandi:** E3 makes use of major learning projects and provides curriculum “scaffolding”, a supporting framework that is placed around a curriculum to build the skills the learners need to master in order to cope with the core curriculum concepts. It involves training that is considered to be more experiential and practical, more fun and inspiring to learners, and which provides tools and ways of thinking to better solve

problems both alone and with others. In this way learners develop relevant skills and competencies needed in a modern economy.

- 2.7 E3 represents all learners in the SA education system who need access to information for their learning. Much of this information is located on the internet and as such is often inaccessible to learners due to the high costs of data or poor network coverage. This submission is a request to assist to make this access easier and more affordable to the youth of our country – thus giving them more of a chance to succeed after their schooling both in SA and in the world.

3. COMMENTS

- 3.1 **We support proposal to impose social obligations:** The IMT Spectrum Notice articulates the Authority's intention to introduce social obligations on successful licensees to be assigned spectrum. The Authority invited stakeholders to make recommendations and proposals on the type, scope, nature, criteria, etc. of social obligations that can be imposed in respect of the licensing process.¹
- 3.2 We support the Authority's proposal to impose social obligations on successful licensees.
- 3.3 **Social obligations accord with policy objectives:** As the IMT Spectrum Notice indicates –
- 3.3.1 a key objective of SA Connect is to ensure inclusion and to give expression to the NDP's vision of "a seamless information infrastructure ... that will underpin a dynamic and connected vibrant information society...";² and

¹ Paras 6.5.1 and 6.5.2 of the IMT Spectrum Notice

² Para 1.5 of the IMT Spectrum Notice

- 3.3.2 the universal provision of broadband services including, in particular, ensuring connectivity for public services such as education, health and government services, is a key policy objective.³
- 3.4 In addition, social (universal service and access obligations) are a concrete step towards realising the vision articulated by President Cyril Ramaphosa at the ITU Telecom World 2018 conference, that:
- 3.5 "It is our task to ensure that the 4th Industrial Revolution improves the human condition and that no one is left behind. It is our task to ensure that this digital revolution responds to the needs of the developing world. It must assist in overcoming unemployment, not exacerbate it. It must bridge the digital divide, not widen it."⁴
- 3.6 **We support zero-rating in relation to PBO and educational content:** As the Authority is no doubt aware, on 2 December 2019 the Competition Commission ("**the Commission**") published its final report on the Data Services Market Inquiry. The Commission called for agreement across all mobile operators on a consistent industry-wide approach to the zero-rating of content from public benefit organisations and educational institutions to ensure broad application, and recommended the establishment of clear principles and criteria to be established, as well as an application process for public benefit organisations (PBOs) and educational institutions seeking zero-rating.⁵
- 3.7 In the Authority's submissions to the Commission on the Data Services Market Inquiry, the Authority–

³ Para 1.6 of the IMT Spectrum Notice

⁴ The Presidency Republic of South Africa Address by President Cyril Ramaphosa at the International Telecommunication Union (ITU) Telecom World 2018, Inkosi Albert Luthuli International Convention Centre, Ethekekwini <http://www.thepresidency.gov.za/speeches/address-president-cyril-ramaphosa-international-telecommunication-union-itu-telecom-world> (accessed 23 January 2020)

⁵ Data Services Market Inquiry Final Report, Competition Commission South Africa, 2 December 2019 (Non-confidential version), para 48.5

- 3.7.1 noted the Commission's concern that the zero-rating of PBO content is voluntary and inconsistent and needs to be regulated; and
- 3.7.2 indicated that it intends imposing obligations to ensure the zero-rating of internet services of educational institutions, and that it had already started engaging with some stakeholders to review their universal service and access obligations.⁶
- 3.8 We applaud the Authority's initiative to promote access to education and PBO content through zero-rating.
- 3.9 As UNESCO states, "it is of crucial importance that all children and young people have access to education".⁷ The World Declaration on Education for All, adopted in Jomtien, Thailand (1990), sets out an overall vision: universalizing access to education for all children, youth and adults, and promoting equity. This means being proactive in identifying the barriers that many encounter in accessing educational opportunities and identifying the resources needed to overcome those barriers. Inclusive education is a process of strengthening the capacity of the education system to reach out to all learners and can thus be understood as a key strategy to achieve Education for All. An "inclusive" education system can only be created if ordinary schools become more inclusive – i.e. if they become better at educating all children in their communities.⁸ It is in this spirit of inclusiveness and Education for All that UNESCO recognises that "accessible and flexible curricula, textbooks and learning materials can serve as the key to creating schools for all".⁹
- 3.10 We accordingly support the Authority's proposal to ensure the zero-rating of the content of PBOs and educational institutions.

⁶ Comments by the Independent Communications Authority of South Africa on the Provisional Findings and Recommendations of the Data Services Market Inquiry by the Competition Commission, 26 June 2019, para 2

⁷ UNESCO Policy Guidelines on Inclusion in Education, 2009, pg 6

⁸ UNESCO Policy Guidelines on Inclusion in Education, 2009, pg 8

⁹ UNESCO Policy Guidelines on Inclusion in Education, 2009, pg 19

3.11 **Type, scope, nature, criteria, etc. of social obligations:**

- 3.11.1 We welcome the opportunity to comment on the type, scope, nature, criteria, etc. of such social obligations.
- 3.12 We submit that the zero-rating of certain public beneficial website addresses (URLs) and apps should be included as a social obligation.
- 3.13 While we are passionate about access to education, we recognise that social obligations must be workable and achievable. They should strike an appropriate balance in the public interest to promote access to education and PBO content without unduly burdening or compromising the licensees concerned or the ICT sector as a whole.
- 3.14 In this spirit, and in an effort to contribute constructively to this debate, we make the specific proposals set out below for the Authority's kind consideration.
- 3.14.1 The obligations should apply to individual ECS and ECNS licensees that are assigned IMT spectrum ("affected licensees").
- 3.14.2 Affected licensees should be required to zero-rate, on request, the wholesale and retail cost of data that would be incurred to access the content on the specific website address (URLs) or apps which are referenced in the application.
- 3.14.3 The request referred to in paragraph 3.14.2 above must be made –
- 3.14.3.1 by any registered non-profit organisation, PBO or educational institution;
- 3.14.3.2 to any affected licensee, to the contact details specified by the affected licensee for that purpose;
- 3.14.3.3 in writing (which may include email), and must specify the relevant websites addresses (URLs) or apps to be zero-rated; provide evidence that the applicant is a registered non-profit organisation, PBO or educational institution (although the URLs or apps need not themselves be owned or provided by the applicant); and

demonstrate that the content available at the relevant website or app constitutes public interest or educational content.

- 3.14.4 Any content which is designed to respect, protect, promote or fulfill any right in the Bill of Rights of the Constitution of South Africa should be considered public interest content unless the affected licensee demonstrates otherwise.
- 3.14.5 Any content which forms part of the curriculum of any primary, secondary or tertiary education institution, or which is provided by any non-profit organisation, PBO or educational institution to promote access to education should be considered educational content unless the affected licensee demonstrates otherwise.
- 3.14.6 The affected licensee should retain the discretion to refuse to zero-rate access to content on good cause shown (e.g. access to bandwidth-intensive content such as audiovisual material which does not form part of the educational curriculum).
- 3.15 We respectfully submit that imposition of social obligations on affected licensees through the zero-rating of access to internet platforms (websites and apps) that host public interest and educational content to the public, in the nature and manner listed above, will go along way to promote access to education and PBO content, while striking an appropriate balance between the interests of the operators concerned.

4. CONCLUSION

- 4.1 We conclude that our recommendations support the objectives set out in the IMT Spectrum Notice, “*to ensure nationwide broadband access for all citizens*”¹⁰ and to:
 - 4.1.1 promote the empowerment of HDGs, in particular youth;
 - 4.1.2 increase universal service and universal access;

¹⁰ Para 3.1 of the IMT Spectrum Notice

- 4.1.3 promote the interests of consumers with regards to the price of electronic communication services; and
- 4.1.4 reduce the cost to communicate, specifically data cost.
- 4.2 We are confident that our submission will be considered and we are eager to be a part of any related consultative process. We kindly request an opportunity to make an oral submission at any hearings to be held by the Authority.
- 4.3 We hope that our submission will contribute constructively and meaningfully to this important matter. For any further information please contact Mark Collie at mark@collie.co.za



Dr Taddy (Adam Paul) Blecher

National Chairperson, E3 Initiative